

**SAN ANTONIO HISTORIC AND DESIGN REVIEW COMMISSION
OFFICIAL MINUTES
AUGUST 1, 2012**

- The Historic and Design Review Commission of the City of San Antonio met in session at 3:00 p.m., in the Board Room, Development and Business Services Center, 1901 S. Alamo
- The meeting was called to order by Commissioner Cone, Chair, and the roll was called by the Secretary.

PRESENT: Cone, Carpenter, Barrera, Guarino, Rodriguez, Connor

ABSENT: Tak, Valenzuela, Salas, Shafer, Zuniga

- Chairman's Statement
- Citizens to be heard
- Announcements

The Commission then considered the Consent Agenda which consisted of:

- | | |
|-----------------------|------------------------------------|
| 1. Case No. 2008-074 | 119 E. Craig Pl. |
| 2. Case No. 2012-209 | 310 W. Commerce |
| 3. Case No. 2012-210 | 456 E. Rosewood |
| 4. Case No. 2012-211 | 151 Oakmont Ct. |
| 5. Case No. 2012-212 | 404 Warren |
| 6. Case No. 2007-329 | 418 Madison |
| 7. Case No. 2012-213 | 1815 Fredericksburg Rd. |
| 8. Case No. 2012-214 | 601 Nolan |
| 9. Case No. 2012-208 | 207 W. Summit |
| 10. Case No. 2012-135 | 110 Tuleta |
| 11. Case No. 2012-215 | W. Mulberry from San Pedro to Main |

Commissioner Carpenter pulled items 1, 10 and 11 from the Consent Agenda to be heard under Individual Consideration.

COMMISSION ACTION:

The motion was made by Commissioner Carpenter and seconded by Commissioner Connor to approve the remaining cases on the Consent Agenda with staff stipulations.

AYES: Cone, Carpenter, Barrera, Guarino, Rodriguez, Connor

NAYS: None

THE MOTION CARRIED.

1. HDRC NO. 2008-074

Applicant: Steven Land Tillotson, Kell Munoz Architects

Address: 119 E. Craig Pl.

The applicant is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness for final approval to construct a new, two-story education building that will contain science laboratories and classrooms. Please note that the permit documents show a base bid stucco finish exterior and an alternate for brick. The applicant seeks approval for the use of either material, which will be ultimately selected on consideration of cost.

COMMISSION ACTION:

The motion was made by Commissioner Guarino and seconded by Commissioner Carpenter to approve the proposed material, massing, and stair. Further detail of the east elevation to be submitted and approved administratively. Denial of signage.

AYES: Carpenter, Barrera, Guarino, Rodriguez, Connor

NAYS: Cone

THE MOTION CARRIED.

10. HDRC NO. 2012-135

Applicant: RVK Architects

Address: 110 Tuleta

Reset to August 15, 2012.

11. HDRC NO. 2012-215

Applicant: Terrence Carbary, City of San Antonio

Address: W. Mulberry from San Pedro to Main

The applicant is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness for approval to construct new ADA compliant curb ramps at the following intersections: W. Mulberry and Belknap (3 corners), W. Mulberry and Howard (4 corners), and W. Mulberry and Main (4 corners). The proposed ramps will connect with the existing sidewalks and some will require low retaining walls. They will be concrete.

Staff finds that the proposed ramps, while contemporary in design, should respect the existing sidewalks in terms of material and detailing, such as stamped concrete elements within the existing sidewalk or unique curb forms. Staff also finds that the proposed ramps will comply with ADA requirements for access to the public right-of-way. Staff finds that introducing retaining walls into locations where they did not previously exist changes the character of the sidewalk and the streetscape and should be avoided wherever possible. Sloped lawns are much more typical of the neighborhood than retaining walls at the corners. Staff also finds that, where possible, alterations to historic fabric should be avoided entirely.

Staff recommends approval with the following stipulations:

1. that the applicant provide detailed drawings for administrative review of the proposed alterations at each intersection prior to construction going forward;
2. that the applicant retain any existing, character defining detailing as mentioned above;
3. that the applicant match the existing material and color of the sidewalks to be altered as closely as possible; and
4. that the applicant avoid the addition of retaining walls or other elements that are not consistent with the existing character unless it can be demonstrated that the elements are necessary for public safety.

COMMISSION ACTION:

The motion was made by Commissioner Rodriguez and seconded by Commissioner Carpenter to approve with staff stipulations and with the additional stipulation that the applicant continue communication with Monte Vista Historic District.

AYES: Cone, Carpenter, Barrera, Rodriguez, Connor

NAYS: None

ABSTAIN: Guarino

THE MOTION CARRIED.

12. HDRC NO. 2012-204

Applicant: Heather Crane

Address: 1407 W. Lynwood Ave.

The applicant is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness for approval to:

Install a fence around the front yard of the property. A previous owner of the house began work on a fence with wooden posts and bull nose wire along the side of the property. The current property owner wishes to extend the previously started fence at a height of 4'. The fence will begin even with the front of the house on both sides of the property to the front sidewalk and across the front of the property with a gate at the existing sidewalk approach. The fence will be constructed of wooden 4" x 4" posts, with a 2" x 6" wood cap and 14 gage fence wire.

Staff finds that the Keystone Park Historic District in general and this block in particular have a defined pattern of open front yards. Front yard fences detract from this neighborhood characteristic. Keystone Park became a historic district in 2009 and since then no new front yard fences have been approved.

Staff does not recommend approval as submitted. Staff finds that front yard fences are not characteristic of the homes in the Keystone Park Historic District and that a fence that goes around the front yard would disrupt the existing pattern of open front yards in this block.

COMMISSION ACTION:

The motion was made by Commissioner Carpenter and seconded by Commissioner Rodriguez to grant denial of fencing request.

AYES: Cone, Carpenter, Barrera, Guarino, Rodriguez, Connor

NAYS: None

THE MOTION CARRIED.

13. HDRC NO. 2012-201

Applicant: Zachary Stingl

Address: 1551 W. Rosewood Ave.

The applicant is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness for approval to:

1. Construct a new street facing gable. The proposed gable will sit behind the main gable of the existing roof and will have the same slope as the existing gable. It will be taller than the existing gable. The proposed roof gable will create usable storage space within the home.
2. Construct a carport at the side of the existing home. The proposed carport will have a gable roof to match the home's roof in slope. It will be self-supported, but it will attach to the existing home through an extension of the home's roof.
3. Replace the existing front door with a new wood and stained glass door.

This application was reviewed by the Design Review Committee on June 26, 2012. At that meeting, the committee noted that the existing home at 1551 W. Rosewood has been altered. The committee found that, while the proposed carport would attach to a part of the roof that is likely not original to the home, a freestanding carport would be more appropriate. The committee also suggested that the applicant consider a shed dormer along the side of the existing gabled roof rather than introducing a prominent new gable to the roof.

1. Staff does not recommend approval as submitted. Staff finds that the addition of a new street facing gable will significantly alter the appearance of this home from the street. Staff recommends that the applicant consider an addition to the home that will have less visual impact on the building's street façade.
2. Staff does not recommend approval as submitted. Staff finds that a freestanding carport closer to the existing accessory building to the rear of the house would be more appropriate.
3. Staff does not recommend approval as submitted. Staff finds that the proposed front door is not in keeping with the style of the home.

COMMISSION ACTION:

The motion was made by Commissioner Rodriguez and seconded by Commissioner Carpenter to grant denial of items 1, 2 and 3 per staff recommendation.

AYES: Cone, Carpenter, Barrera, Guarino, Rodriguez, Connor

NAYS: None

THE MOTION CARRIED.

14. HDRC NO. 2012-203

Applicant: Ann Lewis, Lewis Sign Builders, Inc.

Address: 3030 Roosevelt

Approved administratively.

15. HDRC NO. 2012-216

Applicant: William J. Lyons, Jr.

Address: 430 E. Commerce St.

The applicant is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness for conceptual approval to:

1. Extend the roof (awning) of the River Walk second floor balcony on both the south and north sides to cover the full length of the balcony. Materials would match existing structure;
2. Remove existing entrance awning which currently extends into the Commerce Street right-of-way. Install a new standing seam metal awning below the existing signage at the northwest corner of the building;
3. Extend the parapet wall to match the new length of River Walk second floor balcony awning extension;
4. Construct a walkway for ADA compliant access from Commerce Street to River Walk second floor balcony. The walkway will extend around the existing stair to the River Walk level, and out past the current width of the existing balcony. Four new columns, to match the original columns, are proposed to support the new structure. The proposed structure will be independent from the Commerce Street Bridge. This effort will result in the removal of the existing planter bed and the placement of new columns within the current pedestrian walkway; and
5. Repair water damaged areas of the River Walk second floor balcony structure.

Any new materials will be selected to match existing materials currently in place.

This case was heard by the DRC on July 24, 2012. At that meeting, the Commissioners expressed concern over the effect of the proposed walkway on solar access and the placement of new columns on pedestrian access at the River Walk level. Both the applicant and the Commissioners were in agreement that the proposed walkway would be an improvement to the property by providing ADA access and additional means of egress to the 2nd floor of the building. It was recommended that additional consideration be given on whether the walkway will obstruct any portions of the Commerce Street Bridge. The Commissioners recommended conceptual approval for the submitted proposal with the stipulation that the applicant further

develop the structure and expression of the proposed walkway. Suggested structural systems included either a cantilever or bracketed supports in lieu of columns. It was highly recommended at that time that the applicant develop a detailed drawing set, including 3-dimensional renderings, to fully illustrate the impact of the proposed alterations on the River Walk.

Staff commends the applicant's efforts to use like materials and finishes for all additions to the building. Staff agrees that additional documentation would aid in fully understanding the impact of the proposed alterations.

1. Staff recommends approval as submitted.
2. Staff recommends approval with the stipulation that the new awning located beneath the existing signage consist of clay tile, rather than standing seam, to match other portions of the 2nd floor awning. Staff finds that the removal of the existing entrance awning at Commerce Street will restore balance to the historic façade at Commerce Street.
3. Staff recommends approval as submitted.
4. While staff does not oppose a walkway in any form, staff does not recommend approval as submitted. Further consideration should be given to the impact of the proposed walkway and new columns on the River Walk environment. Additional planning and comprehensive documentation of the proposed walkway will be required for any further design review.
5. Staff recommends approval as submitted.

COMMISSION ACTION:

The motion was made by Commissioner Carpenter and seconded by Commissioner Rodriguez to Approval of newly submitted drawings submitted August 1, 2012. Approval of standing seam awning located below the existing sign on the east façade.

AYES: Cone, Carpenter, Barrera, Guarino, Rodriguez, Connor
NAYS: None

THE MOTION CARRIED.

16. HDRC NO. 2012-217

Applicant: Chester Loyd Casey

Address: 414 Club Dr.

The applicant is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness for approval to:

Install a new security light in the center of the residential parking area. The proposed light will be 100 foot-candles and mounted on a 30 ft. pole.

Staff finds that the proposed pole light is not in keeping with the scale of development in the Monticello Park Historic District. Staff also finds that the proposed light fixture is more suited to a commercial property than a residential one.

Staff does not recommend approval as submitted based on these findings. Staff recommends that a light fixture more appropriate in scale and design to a residential setting be used.

COMMISSION ACTION:

The motion was made by Commissioner Carpenter and seconded by Commissioner Connor to approve with the stipulation that the lowest wattage and foot candle fixture be utilized.

AYES: Cone, Carpenter, Barrera, Guarino, Rodriguez, Connor

NAYS: None

THE MOTION CARRIED.

- Executive Session: Consultation on attorney – client matters (real estate, litigation, contracts, personnel, and security matters) as well as the above mentioned agenda items may be discussed under Chapter 551 of the Texas Government Code.
- Adjournment.

There being no further business, the meeting adjourned at 4:45 P.M.

APPROVED

A handwritten signature in black ink, appearing to read 'Tim Cone', written over a horizontal line.

Tim Cone
Chair